



SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
300 Lakeside Drive, P.O. Box 12688
Oakland, CA 94604-2688
(510) 464-6000

2018

August 14, 2018

Robert Raburn, Ph.D.
PRESIDENT

Nicholas Josefowitz
VICE PRESIDENT

Grace Crunican
GENERAL MANAGER

DIRECTORS

Debora Allen
1ST DISTRICT

Joel Keller
2ND DISTRICT

Rebecca Saltzman
3RD DISTRICT

Robert Raburn, Ph.D.
4TH DISTRICT

John McPartland
5TH DISTRICT

Thomas M. Blalock, P.E.
6TH DISTRICT

Lateefah Simon
7TH DISTRICT

Nicholas Josefowitz
8TH DISTRICT

Bevan Duffy
9TH DISTRICT

Civil Grand Jury—Foreperson
725 Court Street
P.O. Box 431
Martinez, CA 94553-0091

Re: Grand Jury Report No. 1804, "BART Crime and Transparency"

To the Foreperson of the Contra Costa Civil Grand Jury:

In accordance with California Penal Code Sections 933.05(a) and 933.05(b), I am forwarding the BART Board of Directors' responses to Findings 7 and 8 and Recommendations 5 and 6 from the Grand Jury Report No. 1804, "BART Crime and Transparency."

As required, the responses are provided in a hard copy format (attached) and have been e-mailed separately as a Word document to ctadmin@contracosta.courts.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Robert Raburn".

Robert Raburn, President
BART Board of Directors

Responses from the BART Board of Directors to the 2017-2018 Contra Costa Grand Jury Report No. 1804, "BART Crime and Transparency"

Finding 7.

BART parking lots and garages have insufficient lighting and few or no security cameras.

Response: BART partially disagrees with this finding.

Parking Facility Lighting. The lighting in every BART parking garage and parking lot has always met safety and security standards in effect at the time of construction. BART currently uses the standards of the Illuminating Engineering Society (IES), an accredited Standards Development Organization (SDO) that develops its standards using American National Standards Institute (ANSI) approved procedures. When BART replaces all fixtures in a facility as part of a major capital construction project, the IES standards in place at that time are met. BART is currently evaluating upgrading selected parking garage lighting to LEDs.

BART has a third-party vendor contract to regularly maintain parking facility lighting fixtures to ensure they are properly functioning by replacing bulbs, lenses and diffusers as necessary. LEDs last longer and therefore need to be replaced less frequently. Customers may also notify BART of a lighting issue, and BART staff will go out to investigate the issue, making repairs as needed.

In addition, riders give BART parking facility lighting an above average rating of 4.92 (the average rating for all 47 service attributes was 4.53 based on a scale of 1 = Poor and 7 = Excellent), as reported in the 2016 Customer Satisfaction Survey, which was completed by more than 5,300 riders.

Parking Facility Security Cameras. BART's stations and parking facilities have always been built to meet all safety and security standards in effect at the time of construction. In addition, although there is no regulatory requirement to install security cameras, BART has taken the initiative to install them.

Fourteen of BART's 15 parking garages have security cameras. BART's original parking garages, constructed more than 40 years ago, did not include cameras. BART has included cameras in all parking garages constructed since the early 1990s, and older parking garages have been upgraded as part of larger projects to modernize structures.

The District continually assesses its security needs, including the use of cameras, and has prioritized parking lots. The BART Police Department also makes recommendations to improve security, which include improvements in security camera coverage, as part of the Department's overall Community Oriented Policing and Problem Solving (COPPS) philosophy.

Finding 8.

BART officials and riders are dissatisfied with the lack of sanitation in stations, elevators, and restrooms.

Response: BART partially disagrees with this finding.

Since the last Customer Satisfaction Survey in 2016 where riders indicated some dissatisfaction with cleanliness, BART has increased funding for projects and programs that improve system cleanliness and address homelessness. As a result of these efforts, system cleanliness has improved and this should be reflected in more positive ratings from riders taking the upcoming fall 2018 Customer Satisfaction Survey. BART agrees that these projects and programs should continue to ensure continued advancements in cleanliness.

Responses from the BART Board of Directors to the 2017-2018 Contra Costa Grand Jury Report No. 1804, "BART Crime and Transparency"

Recommendation 5.

BART's Board of Directors should consider seeking funds at the next budget funding cycle to equip all parking lots and garages with adequate lighting and working video cameras.

5A. Funding for Parking Facility Lighting.

Response: The recommendation has been implemented.

Parking lot and garage lighting funding is appropriated annually in support of a third-party maintenance contract.

5B. Funding for Video Cameras.

Response: The recommendation has not yet been implemented, but will be implemented as part of the Fiscal Year 2020 budget process.

Based on BART's recent assessment, BART will advance for consideration certain security camera upgrades. That proposed funding will support BART's existing process whereby funds are allocated on an ongoing basis to address security concerns, including video cameras in parking facilities, as identified by the BART Police Department's security review of station modernization and other construction projects.

Recommendation 6.

BART's Board of Directors should consider directing maintenance to make cleanliness a priority and improve the level of sanitation in stations, elevators, and restrooms. If additional personnel is needed, a request for funding may be considered for the next funding cycle.

6A. Prioritizing Cleanliness.

Response: The recommendation has been implemented.

Making cleanliness a priority and improving the level of sanitation continue to be a major focus of BART's annual work program. BART funded cleanliness projects in the Fiscal Year 2018 budget, and the approved Fiscal Year 2019 budget prioritizes Quality of Life issues including cleanliness.

The following initiatives, approved as part of the Fiscal Year 2018 budget, address BART's comprehensive plan for station cleaning improvements. The plan incorporates findings from the 2017 TRA Station Cleaning Study and input from the International Sanitary Supply Association (ISSA), a worldwide cleaning association and benchmarking organization, and includes:

- Hired 21 more cleaners.
- Restructured the System Service group to provide more management oversight, increased ownership and accountability.
- Created five geographic zones and for each zone, established dedicated supervision and workforce, with greater resources deployed at largest and most challenging stations.
- Hired an Employee Development Specialist to advance BART's training program.
- Working to achieve ISSA certification including development and training in standard cleaning tasks.
- Developed and implemented Key Performance Indicators (KPI) aligned by new zones to measure and monitor attendance, overtime and safety performance. Additional KPIs under development.
- Developed a project plan for implementation over the next year of a station cleaning material and tooling inventory system, with initial focus on downtown San Francisco stations.

Responses from the BART Board of Directors to the 2017-2018 Contra Costa Grand Jury Report No. 1804, "BART Crime and Transparency"

- Partnered with BART Police and other station personnel in downtown San Francisco to create a sense of community and to begin to address issues related to drug use and trespassing in stations.
- Holding monthly customer meet-and-greet sessions at stations throughout the system to hear from customers on ways to improve their experience.

In addition, in the Fiscal Year 2019 budget, BART has funded the following initiatives to address homelessness, which will also contribute to greater system cleanliness.

Homeless Outreach Teams. BART, San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA), and the San Francisco Department of Homeless and Supportive Housing partnered to roll out the San Francisco Homeless Outreach Team (SF HOT) in November 2017. This team works closely with BART staff, the San Francisco Police Department, and SFMTA staff to engage the homeless population at the four downtown San Francisco stations. From November 2017 through January 2018, the team has made 258 contacts, 128 referrals, and 266 connections. BART is expanding Homeless Outreach Teams to other stations and counties in FY19 to more effectively tackle the homelessness issue throughout the entire BART system.

BART Police Department Community Outreach. A member of the BART Police Department continues to coordinate the identification of homeless resources and partnerships throughout the four counties BART serves and is the current chairperson of the Alameda County Homeless Task Force, which meets each month at the BART Police Department.

Pit Stops. The Pit Stop Program, managed by the San Francisco Department of Public Works, provides attended restroom facilities in the most challenged areas of San Francisco. BART and Public Works partnered to provide Pit Stop facilities at 16th Street/Mission and Powell Street Stations in FY17 and FY18, and will continue this partnership in FY19 for both stations. A new facility may be added near Embarcadero Station. San Francisco funds a Pit Stop located next to Civic Center Station as well.

Elevator Attendants. BART and SFMTA are partnering to bring attendants to the street and platform elevators at Powell Street and Civic Center Stations to address elevator cleanliness, safety, security, availability, and accessibility issues. Roll-out for this pilot began in April 2018, and the program has been extended to at least November 2019. Data will be collected and analyzed before and after implementation, with the appropriate performance metrics applied.

Security Measures. Security measures will be implemented on prioritized BART properties to reduce encampments in Alameda, Contra Costa, and San Mateo counties, which could include fencing, signage, cameras, and other strategies. This ensures safe and reliable BART operations.

6B. Need for Additional Personnel

Response: This recommendation has not yet been implemented, but will be implemented as part of the Fiscal Year 2020 budget process.